STATE OF ARIZONA FILED

JAN 1 1 1995

STATE OF ARIZONA

DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE

DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE
By

3 In the Matter of

Docket No. 8519

MIDWEST INSURANCE COUNSELORS, INC. dba AVONDALE/GOODYEAR MANN INSURANCE AGENCY, AND MARVIN A. VENS,

ORDER

Respondents.

A hearing on the above-captioned matter took place on the following dates: December 1, 1994, December 9, 1994 and December 14, 1994. Assistant Attorney General Kathryn Leonard represented the Arizona Department of Insurance ("the Department"). Respondent Marvin A. Vens ("Vens") was present in propria persona and appeared on behalf of Respondent Midwest Insurance Counselors, Inc. dba Avondale/Goodyear Mann Insurance Agency ("the Mann Agency"). The following people testified at the hearing: Jacque Hale-Caddell, Samuel Morris, Joyce Fox, Joe Ford, Jr., Della Weisbeck, Richard Page, Gordon J. Dreager, Joanna Taylor, Marvin A. Vens and Investigator Arnold Sniegowski.

On August 23, 1994, acting pursuant to A.R.S.

\$ 20-150, the Director delegated all of his authority, power,
duties and functions, whether ministerial or discretionary,
vested in the Director to Gregory Y. Harris to act as the
Administrative Law Judge in this matter. On November 17, 1994,
the Director delegated all of his authority, power, duties, and
functions, whether ministerial or discretionary, vested in the
Director to Lewis D. Kowal to act as Administrative Law Judge in
this matter and the Director revoked the previous delegation to
Gregory Y. Harris.

 $\frac{28}{t}$

Based upon the entire record in this matter, including all pleadings, motions, testimony, and exhibits admitted during the hearing of this matter, Administrative Law Judge Lewis D.

Kowal has prepared the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order for consideration and approval by the Director of the Arizona Department of Insurance (the "Director"). The Director adopts and enters the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and enters the following Order:

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. At all times material to this matter, Vens was licensed as a property and casualty agent and broker with the state of Arizona, license number 282359. Vens' property and casualty agent and broker licenses expired on October 31, 1994.
- 2. At all times material to this matter, the Mann Agency was licensed as a property and casualty agent with the state of Arizona, license number 557794 which expired on November 30, 1994.
- 3. At all times material to this matter, Vens was designated on the Arizona insurance license of the Mann Agency as the licensed individual authorized to exercise its powers.
- 4. Vens currently holds a life and disability agent's license issued by the state of Arizona, license number 282359 which expires on October 31, 1995.
- 5. At all times material to this matter, Vens was a co-owner of the Mann Agency and operated that agency.
- 6. At all times material to this matter, Vens was authorized to act as an agent for Auto-Owners Insurance Company ("Auto-Owners").

 $\mathbf{2}$

0

5

- 7. On September 9, 1991, Vens received applications for Farmers and Ranchers Liability and Commercial Excess Liability insurance policies for Hale Farms to be placed with Redland Insurance Company ("Redland") and a \$1,647.90 check from Jacque Hale-Caddell as payment for the annual premium on those policies.
- 8. The \$1,647.90 check which Vens received from Ms. Hale-Caddell was deposited in the Mann Agency's account with Security Pacific Bank.
- 9. The Mann Agency submitted to Redland applications for liability coverage on the Hale Farms. Redland returned the applications to the Mann Agency and declined insurance coverage because the Mann Agency failed to provide Redland with photographs and the applications lacked certain underwriting information.
- 10. Vens and the Mann Agency failed to notify Ms. Hale-Caddell or Hale Farms that their applications for coverage with Redland were declined.
- 11. Vens and the Mann Agency did not reimburse Ms. Hale-Caddell the \$1,647.90 premium payment until August 18, 1992.
- 12. Vens and the Mann Agency did not obtain insurance coverage for the Hale Farms after Redland denied coverage and Hale Farms was subject to risk of financial loss from September 9, 1991 through August 18, 1992 until Ms. Hale-Caddell obtained coverage for the Hale Farms through another agency.

Count II - Blondy's Drywall

- 13. On October 16, 1991, the Mann Agency received a \$600.00 check from Mary Korson for a workers' compensation policy for Blondy's Drywall.
- 14. On November 14, 1991, the Mann Agency received a \$650.00 check from Mary Korson as the second premium payment towards the workers' compensation policy for Blondy's Drywall.
- 15. Both of the checks which Mary Korson provided to the Mann Agency, \$600.00 and \$650.00, were deposited by the Mann Agency into its account with Security Pacific Bank.
- 16. Vens and the Mann Agency failed to forward an application and premium payment to any insurer and did not obtain a workers' compensation policy for Blondy's Drywall.
- 17. Neither Vens nor the Mann Agency reimbursed
 Blondy's Drywall the \$1,250.00 premium payment made to the Mann
 Agency for workers' compensation coverage it never received.

Count III - Arkay Drapery Co.

allegations that Vens failed to obtain additional information concerning a tenant liability policy application for Arkay Drapery Co. ("Arkay") and did not resubmit the application to Auto-Owners. Mr. Jon Jorgensen, the underwriting manager of the Mesa branch office of Auto-Owners, stated in a letter marked as State's Exhibit #20 that the Arkay policy was never issued due to either the agent or Auto-Owners and that he could not determine who was at fault. Substantial evidence was not presented at the hearing to permit a determination as to what caused Arkay Drapery

Co. not to have tenant liability insurance coverage and who should be held responsible.

Count IV - John Thome/Samuel Morris

- 19. On November 19, 1991, the Mann Agency received \$256.00 from an escrow account involved in the sale of Samuel Morris' house located at 13216 S. Tuthill, Buckeye, Arizona 85326 (the "Buckeye residence") to John Thome. Samuel Morris deposited the \$256.00 into the escrow account.
- 20. Vens testified that he accepted the \$256.00 premium payment, had an completed application signed by John Thome in November, 1991 and forwarded that application to Auto-Owners for insurance coverage.
- 21. Vens provided to Mr. Thome and Mr. Morris a copy of a Memorandum of Homeowners Policy as proof of insurance coverage by Auto-Owners on the Buckeye residence for November 25, 1991 to November 25, 1992.
- 22. In December, 1992, Vens testified that he first learned that the \$256.00 was paid by Mr. Morris and not Mr. Thome.
- 23. Richard Page, the Southwest Regional Vice
 President of Auto-Owners, testified that Auto-Owners has no
 record of receiving an application for insurance coverage on the
 Buckeye residence and did not issue such coverage.
- 24. Vens testified that he attempted to contact Mr. Thome to return the \$256.00 premium payment but could not locate him.
- 25. Vens and the Mann Agency failed to forward any documentation or premium payment regarding insurance coverage on the Buckeye residence to Auto-Owners.

26. On January 23, 1993, Vens reimbursed Mr. Morris the \$256.00 premium payment by check number 1584 issued from the checking account of A.G.M. Insurance Co., which had purchased the Mann Agency on December 1, 1990.

Count V - Joyce Fox

- 27. On November 25, 1991, the Mann Agency received a \$1,009.00 check from Joyce Fox for a homeowners insurance policy to be issued through Auto-Owners.
- 28. Joyce Fox's \$1009.00 check was deposited into the Mann Agency's account at Security Pacific Bank.
- 29. Vens signed the homeowners declaration sheet indicating insurance coverage for November 22, 1991 to November 22, 1992 through Auto-Owners and sent that declaration sheet along with an Auto-Owners policy to Joyce Fox.
- system", it only checked its computer records for reference as to coverage on Joyce Fox's residence. Auto-Owners has no records indicating that it ever received an application for coverage on Joyce Fox's residence. Therefore, Auto-Owners could not verify coverage for Joyce Fox from November 22, 1991 to November 22, 1992. The computer records of Auto-Owners would reflect if an application on behalf of Joyce Fox was ever received, processed, issued or rejected by Auto-Owners.
- 31. Vens and the Mann Agency failed to forward any documentation and \$1,0009.00 premium payment regarding insurance coverage on Joyce Fox's residence to Auto-Owners and misappropriated or converted the \$1,009.00 premium payment.

Count_VI - Herb White

- 32. On December 5, 1991, Vens received a completed application and a \$194.00 check from Herb White for a dwelling liability insurance policy for a residence located at 1081 W. 3rd Street, Avondale, Arizona ("Avondale residence") to be issued through Auto-Owners.
- 33. Vens and the Mann Agency failed to forward Mr. White's \$194.00 premium payment and December 5, 1991 application on the Avondale residence to Auto-Owners and misappropriated or converted the \$194.00 premium payment.
- 34. On January 23, 1992, Vens received a completed application and \$238.00 check from Herb White for a dwelling liability policy for a residence located at 6202 N. 138th Drive, Glendale, Arizona ("Glendale residence") to be issued through Auto-Owners.
- 35. The Mann Agency forwarded the application for the Glendale residence to Auto-Owners and a declaration sheet indicating coverage for the period January 23, 1992 to January 23, 1993 prepared by Auto-Owners was forwarded to Vens.
- 36. Vens and the Mann Agency failed to forward to Herb White a copy of the declaration sheet indicating coverage for the Glendale residence. Thus, Mr. White did not receive from the Mann Agency proof of coverage on the Glendale residence as he requested.
- 37. Of the documents contained in the Mann Agency's file on Herb White's residences, there is a declaration sheet which purports to show insurance coverage through Auto-Owners for Mr. White's Avondale residence from December 5, 1991 to December 5, 1992. That declaration sheet appears to be a modified copy of

the declaration sheet that shows insurance coverage for Mr. White's Glendale residence and contains the same policy number as that which was assigned to the Glendale residence. The declaration sheet referred to above appears to be an altered document purporting to show insurance coverage by Auto-Owners on the Avondale residence. Neither Vens nor the Mann Agency forwarded the altered declaration sheet to Mr. White.

38. It is unclear as to when the altered declaration sheet was prepared and no evidence was presented at the hearing as to the identity of the person who prepared the altered document. Only employees of the Mann Agency had access to Herb White's files with the Mann Agency.

Count VII - Ford Pest Control

- 39. Joe S. Ford, Jr. received a renewal notice dated February 7, 1992 from Scottsdale Insurance Company ("Scottsdale") stating that Ford Pest Control's commercial general liability policy would expire on April 13, 1992 and that Scottsdale would be willing to renew the policy. The notice requested that a new application be submitted to Scottsdale.
- 40. On March 31, 1992, Mr. Ford gave Vens a \$256.00 check as payment toward the premium due to renew the Scottsdale policy Mr. Ford had on his business, Ford Pest Control.
- 41. On May 8, 1992, Mr. Ford gave a secretary at the Mann Agency a \$256.00 check as payment toward the premium owed on the Ford Pest Control's policy with Scottsdale.
- 42. On June 5, 1992, Mr. Ford gave a secretary at the Mann Agency a \$246.00 check as payment towards the premium owed on the Ford Pest Control's policy with Scottsdale.

3

- 43. All of the checks which Mr. Ford gave to Vens and the Mann Agency were deposited into the Mann Agency's account with Security Pacific Bank.
- 44. A Certificate of Insurance dated April 1, 1992 indicates that Ford Pest Control had commercial liability coverage with Scottsdale effective from April 13, 1992 to April 13, 1993. The Certificate of Insurance submitted to the Arizona Structural Pest Control indicates that the producer was the Mann Agency. The copy of the Certificate of Insurance admitted as evidence in the hearing of this matter (State's Exhibit #47) does not contain any signature including that of Marvin A. Vens. Vens' name is typed on that document as being the authorized representative.
- 45. Scottsdale never received a request to renew the policy on Ford Pest Control from either Mr. Ford or the Mann Agency.
- \$755.00 premium payments and application on behalf of Mr. Ford to Scottsdale and misappropriated or converted the \$755.00 premium payments.
- 47. During the time period from April 13, 1992 through April 13, 1993, Scottsdale did not issue commercial general liability coverage for Ford Pest Control. It was only after April 13, 1993 when the Department became involved in this matter, did Scottsdale agree to retroactively assume coverage for Ford Pest Control from April 13, 1992 to April 13, 1993.

Count V - Sessions Garage

 48. On March 1, 1992, at the request of Jim Sessions, Vens obtained a commercial liability insurance policy for Sessions Garage through Auto-Owners.

- 49. On March 1, 1992, Vens failed to obtain coverage for Sessions' 1970 Chevrolet tow truck as requested by Mr. Sessions.
- 50. Upon receiving his commercial policy, Mr. Sessions contacted Vens to inquire about coverage for his 1970 Chevrolet tow truck. On March 24, 1992, Vens issued to Mr. Sessions an insurance binder and Arizona Automobile Insurance Card which identified Auto-Owners as the insurance carrier.
- 51. Vens and the Mann Agency did not submit the appropriate documentation to Auto-Owners regarding automobile liability coverage on Mr. Sessions' 1970 tow truck for the period March, 1992 to February, 1993.
- 52. Auto-Owners received full documentation and underwriting information from the Mann Agency on Mr. Sessions' 1970 tow truck in March, 1993 and issued coverage on the 1970 tow truck at that time.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. Respondents' conduct described constitutes a record of dishonesty in business and financial matters under A.R.S. § 20-290(B)(2).
- 2. Respondents' conduct constitutes the existence of any cause for which original issuance or any renewal of an insurance license could have been refused such that Respondents' licenses may be suspended or revoked under A.R.S. §§20-316(A)(1) and 20-290(B)(2).

3. Respondents' conduct conscitutes misappropriation, conversion or illegal withholding of monies belonging to policyholders, insurers, beneficiaries or others, and received in or during the conduct of business under their licenses or through their use, in violation of A.R.S. §20-316(A)(4).

- 4. Respondents' conduct constitutes a conduct of affairs under their licenses showing them to be incompetent or a source of injury and loss to, or repeated complaint by the public or any insurer, in violation of A.R.S. \$20-316(A)(7).
- 5. The Mann Agency's license may be suspended, revoked or refused for any causes as relate to any individual designated in the license to exercise its powers pursuant to A.R.S. §20-316(B).
- 6. Grounds exist to suspend, revoke, or refuse to renew Respondents' licenses, impose a civil penalty and order restitution pursuant to A.R.S. §§20-316(A) and 20-316(C).

ORDER

IT IS ORDERED that:

- 1. All insurance licenses issued to Midwest Counselors, Inc. dba Avondale/Goodyear Mann Insurance Agency and Marvin A. Vens are revoked effective immediately.
- 2. Pursuant to A.R.S. §20-316, Midwest Counselors Inc. dba Avondale/Goodyear Mann Insurance Agency shall pay a civil penalty to the Arizona Department of Insurance in the amount of \$1,250.00 within 20 days of this Order.
- 3. Pursuant to A.R.S. §20-316, Marvin A. Vens shall pay a civil penalty to the Arizona Department of Insurance in the amount of \$1,250.00 within 20 days of this Order.

Midwest Counsellors, Inc. dba Avondale/Goodyear Mann Insurance Agency and Marvin A. Vens shall be jointly and severally liable to make restitution payments of: a) \$1,250.00 to Blondy's Drywall; b) \$1,009.00 To Joyce Fox; and c) \$194.00 to Herb White within 20 days of this order. Proof that restitution payments have been made shall be filed with the Arizona Department of Insurance within 45 days of the date of this Order.

EFFECTIVE this 11th day of January, 1995.

CHRIS HERSTAM Director of Insurance

Administrative Law Judge

NOTIFICATION OF RIGHTS

The aggrieved party may request a rehearing with respect to this Order by filing a written petition with the Administrative Law Division within 30 days of the date of this Order, setting forth the basis for such relief pursuant to A.A.C. R4-14-114(B). The final decision of the Director may be appealed to the Superior Court of Maricopa County for judicial review pursuant to A.R.S. §20-166.

25

26

27

1 COPY of the foregoing mailed/delivered this 11th day of January, 1995, to: 2 Gay Ann Williams, Deputy Director 3 Charles R. Cohen, Executive Assistant Director John Gagne, Acting Manager, Investigations 4 Maureen Catalioto, Supervisor, Licensing Department of Insurance 5 2910 N. 44th Street, Suite 210 Phoenix, Arizona 85018 6 Kathryn Leonard 7 Assistant Attorney General 1275 West Washington 8 Phoenix, AZ 85007 9 Midwest Insruance Counselors, Inc. dba Avondale/Goodyear Mann 10 Insurance Agency Box 47 11 Goodyear, AZ 85338 12 Marvin A. Vens 7214 N. 45th Ave. 13 Glendale, AZ 85301 A M G Insurance Agency, Inc. 14 5130 N. 19th Ave., #5 Phoenix, AZ 85015 15 Auto-Owners Insurance Company 16 6101 Anacapri Blvd. Lansing, MI 17 48917 Auto-Owners Life Insurance Company 18 P.O. Box 30660 48909-8160 Lansing, MI 19 Bankers Insurance Company 20 1005: 5th Street, N. St. Petersburg, FL -33702 21 CNA Insurance Companies 22 CNA Plaza Chicago, IL 60685 23 Employers Modern Life Company 24 P.O. Box 712 25 Des Moines, IA 50303 Employers Mutual Casualty Company 26P.O. Box 35250 Phoenix, AZ 85069-5250 27

1 Franklin Life Insurance Company #1 Franklin Square 2 Springfield, IL 62713 3 Lone Star Life Insurance Company P.O. Box 879008 4 Dallas, TX 75287-9008 5 Principal Mutual Life Insurance Company 711 High Street 6 Des Moines, IA 50392 7 Statewide Insurance Corp. P.O. Box 52048 8 Phoenix, AZ 85072 9 United General Life Insurance Company 5335 66th Street, N. 10 St. Petersburg, FL 33709 Herbert White 11 302 E. Congress 12 Tucson, AZ 85701-1812 13 Jacque Caddell P.O. Box 478 Cashion, AZ 85329 14 15 Jim Sessions 238 W. Western Ave. 16 Avondale, AZ 85323 17 Joe Ford, Jr. 319 Los Amigos Avondale, AZ 85323 18 19 Joyce Fox 2118 Encanto Dr., SW 20 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Marry Korson 21 c/o Blondy's Drywall 22 5932 W. Bell Rd., D-106 Glendale, AZ 85308 23 Kay Kluczniac c/o Arkay Drapery Co. 24 16065 Grand Ave. Surprise, AZ 85374 25 26 27 28

Samuel Morris 9009 S. Cactus Sun Lakes, AZ 85248

Chris Crawford